

Effects of TV Commercial Tactics on Recall, Comprehension, and Persuasion

Source: David W. Stewart & Scott Koslow (1989), "Executional Factors and Advertising Effectiveness: A Replication,"
Journal of Advertising, 18 (3), 21-32, Table C-1 (reprinted with the permission of David Stewart)

| | Reliability ^a | Frequency ^b | Relationship to ^c | | |
|---|--------------------------|------------------------|------------------------------|---------------|------------|
| | | | Recall | Comprehension | Persuasion |
| Information content | | | | | |
| 1. Price | .98 | 0.4 | +0.08 | +0.10 | .00 |
| 2. Value | .98 | 2.0 | +0.04 | +0.04 | -0.01 |
| 3. Quality | .46 | 87.2 | +0.01 | -0.03 | .00 |
| 4. Economy/savings | .97 | 2.6 | +0.07 | +0.08 | -0.03 |
| 5. Dependability/reliability | .88 | 4.2 | -0.01 | +0.04 | -0.05 |
| 6. Sensory (taste, smell) | .89 | 48.5 | +0.09 | -0.03 | +0.05 |
| 7. Aesthetic | .85 | 1.0 | -0.03 | -0.01 | +0.05 |
| 8. Components/ingredients | .85 | 60.1 | -0.09 | -0.12 | -0.09 |
| 9. Availability | .99 | 3.2 | -0.06 | -0.05 | +0.05 |
| 10. Packaging | 1.00 | 1.9 | -0.05 | -0.06 | -0.02 |
| 11. Guarantees | 1.00 | 0.4 | -0.01 | -0.04 | -0.03 |
| 12. Safety | .93 | 3.8 | -0.07 | -0.06 | -0.02 |
| 13. Nutrition/health | .86 | 27.6 | -0.24 | -0.18 | -0.14 |
| 14. Independent research | .95 | 0.7 | -0.02 | -0.04 | +0.03 |
| 15. Company research | .98 | 0.1 | -0.04 | -0.02 | -0.07 |
| 16. Research (no source) | .93 | 2.0 | -0.07 | -0.06 | -0.01 |
| Research findings (composite variables 14, 15, 16) | .94 | 2.8 | -0.08 | -0.08 | -0.01 |
| 17. New uses | .87 | 0.6 | +0.04 | .00 | -0.02 |
| 18. Company image/reputation | .90 | 3.3 | .00 | -0.02 | -0.07 |
| 19. Results of using | .78 | 55.2 | -0.01 | +0.11 | +0.04 |
| 20. User satisfaction | 1.00 | 20.6 | -0.06 | -0.08 | -0.03 |
| 21. Superiority | .57 | 73.2 | -0.06 | -0.06 | +0.04 |
| 22. Convenience of use | .87 | 7.9 | +0.15 | +0.21 | +0.10 |
| 23. Special offer/event | 1.00 | 0 | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| 24. New product or features | .96 | 47.3 | -0.05 | -0.01 | +0.16 |
| 25. Use occasion | .91 | 0.7 | -0.00 | +0.02 | -0.04 |
| 26. Characteristics/image of users | .86 | 1.6 | -0.03 | -0.05 | -0.01 |
| Brand/product identification | | | | | |
| 27. Nonproduct/multiproduct | .57 | | +0.02 | +0.03 | +0.16 |
| 28. Double-branded | .77 | 31.7 | -0.03 | +0.05 | +0.09 |
| 29. Manufacturer/distributor identification | .76 | 39.4 | +0.01 | +0.07 | .00 |
| 30. Visual brand sign-off | .83 | 94.9 | +0.07 | +0.04 | +0.03 |
| 31. Auditory brand sign-off | .86 | 70.8 | +0.01 | +0.02 | -0.02 |
| Congruence of commercial elements | | | | | |
| 32. Brand name reinforces | .77 | 27.0 | +0.06 | +0.08 | +0.08 |
| 33. Setting not related | .81 | 2.4 | +0.01 | .00 | -0.05 |
| 34. Relevant setting | .66 | 6.9 | -0.03 | -0.07 | -0.04 |
| 35. Setting directly related | .86 | 64.7 | +0.12 | +0.11 | +0.04 |
| 36. No setting | .93 | 20.6 | -0.09 | -0.07 | +0.05 |
| Visual devices | | | | | |
| 37. Scenic beauty | .96 | 2.2 | -0.02 | .00 | -0.08 |
| 38. Beauty of characters | .91 | 1.0 | -0.00 | +0.03 | -0.04 |
| 39. Ugliness of characters | .98 | .01 | -0.04 | -0.02 | -0.02 |
| 40. Graphic displays | .92 | 6.5 | -0.08 | -0.07 | -0.04 |
| 41. Surrealistic visuals | .92 | 3.8 | -0.02 | -0.04 | -0.05 |
| 42. Substantive supers | .91 | 92.5 | -0.09 | -0.05 | -0.04 |
| 43. Visual tagline | .92 | 1.1 | +0.02 | +0.02 | -0.04 |
| 44. Visual memory device | .70 | 5.5 | -0.01 | -0.01 | -0.03 |

| | Reliability ^a | Frequency ^b | Relationship to ^c | | |
|---|--------------------------|------------------------|------------------------------|---------------|------------|
| | | | Recall | Comprehension | Persuasion |
| <i>Auditory devices</i> | | | | | |
| 45. Memorable rhyme/mnemonic | .70 | 7.5 | -.05 | +.05 | +.03 |
| 46. Unusual sound effects | .83 | 1.8 | +.03 | +.02 | -.03 |
| 47. Spoken tagline | .95 | 2.2 | +.05 | +.03 | -.01 |
| <i>Promises, appeals, propositions</i> | | | | | |
| 48. Attributes/ingredients | .76 | 55.1 | -.07 | -.08 | -.06 |
| 49. Product performance benefits | .84 | 67.7 | -.06 | +.07 | +.01 |
| 50. Psychological benefits | .59 | 1.2 | +.01 | -.01 | .00 |
| 51. Product reminder | .33 | 25.6 | +.07 | -.03 | -.08 |
| 52. Sexual appeal | .97 | 0.8 | -.03 | -.03 | -.03 |
| 53. Comfort appeal | .83 | 0.6 | -.03 | .00 | .00 |
| 54. Safety appeal | .93 | 1.2 | -.03 | -.04 | -.08 |
| 55. Enjoying life | .80 | 10.2 | +.05 | -.02 | -.04 |
| 56. Welfare appeals | .90 | 0.3 | .00 | -.01 | -.02 |
| 57. Social approval | .90 | 0.3 | .00 | -.01 | -.02 |
| 58. Self-esteem | .89 | 3.0 | .00 | .00 | -.01 |
| 59. Achievement | 1.00 | 0 | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| 60. Excitement/variety | .84 | 1.1 | +.06 | +.02 | -.06 |
| <i>Commercial tone or atmosphere</i> | | | | | |
| 61. Cute/adorable | .93 | 7.7 | +.17 | +.04 | -.01 |
| 62. Hard sell | .64 | 3.2 | -.02 | .00 | +.06 |
| 63. Warm/caring | .71 | 5.1 | -.03 | -.05 | -.04 |
| 64. Modern/contemporary | .43 | 25.2 | -.02 | +.03 | +.04 |
| 65. Wholesome/health | .55 | 6.9 | -.07 | -.04 | -.04 |
| 66. Technological/futuristic | .94 | 1.9 | -.05 | -.06 | -.02 |
| 67. Conservative/traditional | .68 | 20.1 | -.10 | -.05 | -.06 |
| 68. Old fashioned/nostalgic | .93 | 0.6 | .00 | -.02 | -.03 |
| 69. Happy/fun-loving | .82 | 4.8 | +.06 | -.02 | -.04 |
| 70. Cool/laid back | 1.00 | 0.1 | +.01 | +.01 | +.01 |
| 71. Somber/serious | .59 | 5.8 | -.05 | -.01 | .00 |
| 72. Uneasy/tense | .76 | 0.6 | -.01 | +.02 | +.02 |
| 73. Relaxed/comfortable | .66 | 18.1 | -.02 | -.01 | +.08 |
| 74. Glamorous | .92 | 1.2 | -.01 | -.04 | .00 |
| 75. Humorous | .85 | 5.3 | +.13 | +.07 | +.04 |
| 76. Suspenseful | .97 | 0.2 | +.01 | .00 | +.02 |
| 77. Rough/rugged | .95 | 0.5 | +.09 | +.08 | +.08 |
| <i>Comparisons</i> | | | | | |
| 78. Direct comparison | .98 | 10.9 | -.10 | -.09 | +.01 |
| 79. Indirect comparison | .74 | 28.1 | -.01 | -.01 | +.07 |
| 80. Unsubstantiated claim (puffery) | .73 | 57.5 | +.09 | +.08 | +.04 |
| <i>Commercial structure</i> | | | | | |
| 81. Opening surprise/suspense | .61 | 76.6 | +.10 | +.08 | +.06 |
| 82. Surprise in middle | .60 | 0.4 | +.04 | +.02 | -.02 |
| 83. Surprise at closing | .87 | 0.1 | -.02 | -.02 | -.01 |
| 84. Unusual setting/situation | .80 | 1.7 | -.02 | -.02 | -.094 |
| 85. Humorous closing | .87 | 1.7 | +.01 | +.01 | -.07 |
| 86. Blind lead-in | 1.00 | 0.7 | -.03 | +.01 | -.01 |
| 87. Message in middle | .98 | 0.4 | .00 | -.01 | +.01 |

| | Reliability ^a | Frequency ^b | Relationship to ^c | | |
|---|--------------------------|------------------------|------------------------------|---------------|------------|
| | | | Recall | Comprehension | Persuasion |
| Commercial format | | | | | |
| 88. Vignettes | .95 | 3.6 | -.05 | -.03 | -.05 |
| 89. Continuity of action | .62 | 94.4 | +.06 | +.04 | +.07 |
| 90. Slide of life | .80 | 32.3 | +.04 | +.03 | -.02 |
| 91. Testimonial of user | .82 | 13.5 | -.05 | -.02 | -.06 |
| 92. Endorsement (celebrity/authority) | .96 | 3.7 | -.02 | -.02 | -.04 |
| 93. Announcement | .78 | 2.6 | -.08 | -.04 | +.02 |
| 94. Demonstration (product use) | .74 | 59.7 | +.25 | +.17 | -.09 |
| 95. Demonstration (results) | .82 | 235 | +.09 | +.16 | -.06 |
| 96. Comedy/satire | .87 | 1.9 | +.8 | +.01 | .00 |
| 97. Animation/cartoon ^d | 1.00 | 6.7 | +.15 | +.05 | -.02 |
| 98. Stills/storyboard | .98 | 21.4 | -.00 | -.13 | -.09 |
| 99. Moods/image dominant | .52 | 31.0 | +.03 | +.05 | +.05 |
| 100. Serious drama | .43 | 1.5 | -.04 | -.01 | +.03 |
| 101. Fantasy/surrealism | .89 | 5.2 | +.07 | +.01 | .00 |
| 102. Problem/solution | .75 | 18.1 | -.01 | +.06 | -.02 |
| 103. Interview | .98 | 1.5 | -.05 | -.02 | -.03 |
| 104. Camera involves audience | .73 | 0.5 | -.04 | -.05 | -.06 |
| 105. New wave/product graphics | .99 | 0.4 | +.01 | +.01 | +.09 |
| 106. Number of words | .94 | 2 = 0.3 3 = 99.7 | - | - | - |
| 107. Visual face | 1.00 | 3 = .05 2 = 99.5 | - | - | - |
| Music and dancing | | | | | |
| 108. Music present | .96 | 42.3 | .00 | -.05 | .00 |
| 109. Music major element | .97 | 11.5 | +.06 | -.01 | -.02 |
| 110. Music creates mood | .67 | 2.3 | +.02 | -.02 | -.05 |
| 111. Dancing | .99 | 0.5 | .00 | -.02 | -.03 |
| 112. Music/dancing extravaganza | 1.00 | 0.1 | -.01 | -.02 | -.01 |
| 113. Well-known music | .99 | 0.9 | +.03 | -.03 | -.05 |
| 114. Continuing theme music | .97 | 2.0 | -.08 | +.06 | +.05 |
| Commercial characters | | | | | |
| 115. Male principle character | .96 | 53.9 | -.06 | -.00 | -.10 |
| 116. Female principal character | .97 | 61.1 | -.06 | +.02 | -.03 |
| 117. Child/infant principal character | .99 | 12.7 | +.10 | +.05 | +.01 |
| 118. Racial/ethnic minority principal character | .99 | 1.3 | +.05 | -.01 | -.03 |
| 119. Celebrity principal character | .99 | 4.2 | +.02 | .00 | -.05 |
| 120. Actor playing role of principal character | .85 | 45.3 | -.05 | +.02 | +.07 |
| 121. Real person principal character | .95 | 1.7 | -.02 | +.01 | -.02 |
| 122. Created principal character | .99 | 1.7 | +.02 | -.03 | -.06 |
| 123. Animal principal character | .99 | 8.4 | +.16 | -.06 | -.03 |
| 124. Animated cartoon principal character | 1.00 | 12.5 | +.16 | .04 | -.01 |
| 125. No principal character | .93 | 6.3 | -.07 | +.01 | +.07 |
| 126. Character identified with company | .95 | 0.7 | +.07 | .00 | -.07 |
| 127. Background cast | .92 | 26.8 | -.03 | -.08 | -.12 |
| 128. Racial/ethnic minor role | .98 | 1.1 | -.02 | -.04 | -.05 |
| 129. Celebrity in minor role | 1.00 | 0 | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| 130. Animal(s) minor role | .96 | 1.8 | +.02 | +.02 | +.01 |
| 131. Created/cartoon minor character | .88 | 0.6 | .00 | -.01 | -.01 |
| 132. real person(s) minor role | .96 | 0.1 | -.01 | -.02 | -.01 |
| 133. Continuing character in campaign | .96 | 0.6 | +.05 | -.02 | -.04 |

| | Reliability ^a | Frequency ^b | Relationship to ^c | | |
|--|--------------------------|--|------------------------------|---------------|------------|
| | | | Recall | Comprehension | Persuasion |
| 134. Spokesperson on camera | .64 ^c | voice over = 32.8 voice over + spokesperson = 60.0 spokesperson = 7.2 | -.02 | -.06 | -.03 |
| Commercial setting | | | | | |
| 134. Indoors | .95 | .63 | +.04 | +.08 | +.03 |
| 135. Outdoors | .97 | 22.6 | +.06 | -.03 | -.09 |
| 136. No setting | .93 | 22.9 | -.11 | -.09 | +.04 |
| Commercial approach | | | | | |
| 137. Emotional appeal | .37 ^c | more rational = 28.4 balanced = 64.0 more emotional = 7.5 more negative = 0.2 | +.18 | +.10 | 0.6 |
| 138. | .29 ^c | balanced = 34.5 more positive = 65.2 | +.04 | -.04 | -.10 |
| 139. Brand-differentiating method | .75 | 44.4 | +.15 | +.16 | +.25 |
| Timing and other variables | | | | | |
| V002. Length (seconds) | 1.00 | \bar{x} = 30.4 s.d. = 3.5 | +.08 | +.09 | +.03 |
| V003. Number of times brand names is mentioned | .95 | \bar{x} = 3.7 s.d. = 1.7 | +.09 | +.02 | +.02 |
| V004. Time until product category identified | .87 | \bar{x} = 4.8 s.d. = 4.2 | -.08 | -.02 | -.04 |
| V005. Time until brand name identified | .96 | \bar{x} = 6.2 s.d. = 4.8 | -.09 | .00 | -.01 |
| V006. Time until product/package is shown | .94 | \bar{x} = 6.6 s.d. = 5.1 | -.08 | -.03 | -.04 |
| V007. Time product is on screen (seconds) | .91 | \bar{x} = 17.3 s.d. = 7.2 | +.13 | +.09 | +.10 |
| V008. Time package is on screen (seconds) | .95 | \bar{x} = 13.6 s.d. = 6.5 | -.01 | -.02 | -.01 |
| V009. Number of times brand name/logo is on screen | .84 | \bar{x} = 4.1 s.d. = 2.3 | +.07 | -.03 | +.01 |
| V010. Time brand name/logo is on screen | .91 | \bar{x} = 14.6 s.d. = 3.5 | +.05 | .00 | -.01 |
| V011. Principal message in first 10 seconds | .84 | \bar{x} = 30.4 s.d. = 3.5 | +.05 | -.01 | +.03 |
| V012. Vignettes | .78 | \bar{x} = 30.4 s.d. = 3.5 | -.02 | +.01 | -.05 |
| V013. Number of on-screen characters | .97 | \bar{x} = 30.4 s.d. = 3.5 | .00 | -.11 | -.12 |

| | Reliability ^a | Frequency ^b | Relationship to ^c | | |
|--|--------------------------|------------------------|------------------------------|---------------|------------|
| | | | Recall | Comprehension | Persuasion |
| Created variables | | | | | |
| Total information (sum of variables 1-26) | | | - .13 | - .09 | + .01 |
| Total proportions (sum of variables 48-51) | | | - .08 | - .04 | - .06 |
| Total psychological appeals (sum of variables 52-60) | | | - .03 | - .10 | - .12 |
| Total emotional appeals (sum of variables 53-77) | | | + .05 | .00 | + .01 |
| Commercial finish [nonlive (storyboard for example) = 27.8, live = 72.2] | | | + .13 | + .12 | + .07 |
| Product categories (reliability - .99) | | | | | |
| Breakfast food | 5.4 | | | | |
| Beverages | 4.5 | | - | - | |
| Entrees | 6.5 | | | | |
| Snacks | 3.8 | + | | + | |
| All other food | 18.6 | | | | |
| Over-the-counter remedies | | 14.7 | - | - | - |
| All other over-the-counter products | | 10.0 | - | - | |
| Cleansers/shiners/polishers | | 11.7 | | | |
| All other household products | | 7.3 | + | + | + |
| Hygiene products | | 4.4 | | | |
| All other personal care | | 6.9 | - | - | |
| Soft/hard goods | | 6.1 | + | + | + |

All statistical relationships are reported at two significance levels (.95 and .90) and for all variables regardless of their frequency of occurrence in the database. Two cautions should be observed in using the table:

1. For lower significance levels, the opportunity is great for pure statistical artifacts, or chance findings, to show up as being significant.
2. For variables occurring in only a few commercials, readers should not conclude that there is necessarily a relationship between that variable (for example, dancing in the commercial) and getting high recall or persuasion.

^a The reliability statistic is a correlational measure of the degree to which the four coders (two coders for timing and counting variables) agree on each commercial for that variable. For nondichotomous categorical variables, a contingency coefficient is used (marked by a “c”). For the interval-scaled timing and counting variables, the reliability statistics is Pearson’s *R*.

^b Frequency is expressed as a percentage – .04 = four-tenths of a percent of commercials had that characteristic; 2 = 2 percent; and so on. Since there were a total of 1,059 commercials in the database, each one-tenth percent is equivalent to roughly one commercial. \bar{x} represents the mean and s.d. represents standard deviation.

^c The statistics of the relationship are all correlation measures between the (independent) commercial executional variable and the (dependent) commercial performance measures:

For the dichotomous variables: Eta

For the nondichotomous categorical variables: Eta

For the interval-scaled timing and counting variables and created variables (for example, total information):

Pearson’s *R*.

^d Mainly driven by storyboard animatics, not animation in finished commercials; animation in finished commercials occurred in less than 1 percent of commercials.